

Choosing an Electoral System to Design

Why you would want one system over another?

Your priority objectives

- Your key objectives are:
 - Each geographic area of the province should have at least one representative.
 - The number of seats a party wins should more closely reflect its vote share.
 - Voters should be able to indicate both their preferred party and candidate.

Our task for today

- Keeping in mind the design objectives the Assembly identified, pick an electoral system to design in weekend 2

Things to keep in mind...

- Choosing a system to design is not the same as choosing your preferred electoral system
- You are testing how well alternative systems meet your priority objectives
- We will not have time to design more than two systems

Why is this important?

- You can't properly or meaningfully assess other systems until you have designed them in some detail.

What are the choices?

| | |
|----------------------|--|
| Majority Systems | Alternative Vote (AV) |
| | Two Round System (TRS) |
| Proportional Systems | List Proportional Representation (List PR) |
| | Single Transferable Vote (STV) |
| Mixed Systems | Mixed Member Proportional (MMP) |
| | Parallel |

What are the choices?

You will choose one of these six systems to design next weekend.

Alternative Vote (AV)

Two Round System (TRS)

List Proportional Representation
(List PR)

Single Transferable Vote (STV)

Mixed Member Proportional (MMP)

Parallel

Why would you want a majority family electoral system (AV or TRS)?

- you believe that majority governments are important
- you want local candidates who win to have a greater level of constituency support
- you think that geographic representation is very important

Why would you want a majority family electoral system (AV or TRS)?

- you want all members to be from a local riding
- you believe that voter choice (through ordinal ballots or two rounds of voting) is important
- you do not think proportionality is important

Why would you want List PR?

- you think proportionality is very important
- you think demographic representation is important
- you want more parties in the legislature

Why would you want List PR?

- you think that coalition governments can be stable and effective
- you don't think local representation is important or you feel that regional representation through multi-member districts is as good if not better
- you think it is important to vote for a party

Why would you want the single transferable vote system?

- you like that everyone represents a geographic area in multi-member districts
- you like the voter choice STV gives you *i.e.*, voting for candidates of different parties through ordinal ballots or those from the same party

Why would you want the single transferable vote system?

- you are comfortable with the degree of proportionality that this system gives you
- you think that coalition governments can be stable and effective

Why would you want a parallel system?

- you want to vote for a candidate and party
- you like larger parties but want smaller parties to get some representation

Why would you want a parallel system?

- you think that local representation is important
- you like proportionality but not at the risk of losing the likelihood of single party majority governments
- you think that modest proportionality is enough

Why would you want a mixed member proportional system?

- you think that local representation is important
- you want more proportionality than parallel gives you
 - you can live with compromising both of these a bit
- you want to vote for a candidate and party
- you think that coalition governments can be stable and effective

What's next?

- In groups
- you will *collectively* discuss how well these systems meet the Assembly's design objectives
- you will *individually* rank systems using a preferential ballot

What's next?

- After your group discussion, you will report back to the plenary where we will see if a consensus emerges
- This will decide what model you want to design for weekend two

Your choice of models to design in weekend two

